Case Study

Efficacy of Script Training on Broca's Aphasia Patients

Aliha Arif[1], Muhammad Azzam Khan[2], Muhammad Sikander Ghayas Khan[3]*, Saffa Nawaz[2], Amna Rashid[4], Aneela Sattar[5], Faiza Arshad[1]

[1]Speech Language Pathologist, Department of Rehabilitation Sciences, Faculty of Allied Health Sciences, University of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan.
[2]Lecturer, Department of Rehabilitation Sciences, Faculty of Allied Health Sciences, University of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan.
[3]Professor, Department of Rehabilitation Sciences, Faculty of Allied Health Sciences, University of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan.
[4]Assistant Professor, Department of Rehabilitation Sciences, Faculty of Allied Health Sciences, University of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan.
[5]Senior Speech Language Pathologist, Mukhtar A. Sheikh Hospital, Multan, Pakistan.
*Corresponding Author: Muhammad Sikander Ghayas Khan, Professor; Email: dr.sikander05@gmail.com
Conflict of Interest: None.

ABSTRACT

Background: Broca's Aphasia is a language disorder characterized by difficulties in speech production and fluency, significantly affecting communication. Script training, a language rehabilitation technique, has shown promise in treating this condition. However, its efficacy in a controlled clinical setting had yet to be fully explored.

Objective: The objective of this study was to assess the effectiveness of script training in improving the expressive language abilities of individuals with Broca's Aphasia.

Methods: This case report study was conducted over a period of six months at the University of Lahore Teaching Hospital. Using purposive sampling, patients diagnosed with Broca's Aphasia were selected. Participants underwent script training sessions, which involved repetitive practice of personalized scripts. The Mississippi Aphasia Screening Test (MAST) was employed for initial assessments and tracking progress. Ethical considerations were strictly adhered to, with informed consent obtained from all participants. The study included both quantitative and qualitative methods for data analysis.

Results: The study demonstrated significant improvements in participants' expressive language abilities. Pre-therapy MAST scores averaged at 10/50, which increased to an average of 23/50 post-therapy. Notable areas of improvement included Naming (from 3/10 to 6/10), Automatic Speech (from 1/10 to 6/10), and Verbal Fluency (from 1/10 to 6/10). However, Repetition and Writing/Spelling showed minimal changes.

Conclusion: Script training showed a significant positive impact on the expressive language skills of individuals with Broca's Aphasia. This suggests that script training can be a beneficial therapeutic intervention in the language rehabilitation of Broca's Aphasia patients, particularly in enhancing Naming, Automatic Speech, and Verbal Fluency. Future studies should investigate long-term effects and the integration of script training with other therapeutic approaches.

Keywords: Broca's Aphasia, Script Training, Language Rehabilitation, Expressive Language, Mississippi Aphasia Screening Test (MAST), Speech Therapy.

INTRODUCTION

Script training has emerged as a promising therapeutic intervention for individuals with Broca's aphasia, a severe language disorder stemming from damage to the left frontal lobe of the brain, specifically in Broca's area. This condition, characterized by difficulties in fluent speech, grammatical sentence formation, and word retrieval, significantly impairs effective communication and social participation (1). Despite the absence of a cure for Broca's aphasia, various rehabilitation therapies, including script training, have been developed to aid recovery and enhance communication skills (2).

The efficacy of script training in treating Broca's aphasia has been the subject of multiple research studies, highlighting its potential over traditional language therapies. For example, Dignam JK (2016) conducted a randomized controlled trial comparing script training with other rehabilitation techniques such as neurostimulation therapy and conventional speech therapy (3). The results indicated significant improvements in communication abilities among those who received script training. Similarly, Schaffer KM (2021) from the Stroke Association Rehabilitation, Education and Training (START) reported enhancements in functional language abilities and daily life activities following script training (4). Newman-Norlund (2022) further corroborated these findings, revealing

enhanced word retrieval and grammatical sentence production in patients undergoing script training compared to those receiving usual care or no treatment (5).

Script training's mechanism is rooted in focused language practice and implicit learning paradigms. It involves repetition and practice of targeted language scripts, allowing patients to concentrate on specific language structures and improve these areas. Additionally, this training method facilitates unconscious learning processes that strengthen neural networks involved in language production, leading to more automatic language production over time (6). Furthermore, it fosters the development of meta-cognitive awareness of speech and language structures, aiding spontaneous language production and enhancing communication skills (7).

The research also extends to the neurological impacts of script training. Fridriksson et al. (2012) used functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI) to observe increased activation in the left inferior frontal gyrus, associated with language production, in patients who received script training (8). This suggests a neural basis for the improvements seen in language tasks following script training (8, 9). Despite its efficacy, script training does have limitations. It may require tailoring to individual needs and abilities, and the generalization of language skills remains a concern. Albright E (2006) emphasizes the need for a tailored approach in script training to cater to the diverse requirements and capabilities of individuals with Broca's aphasia (10).

Script training presents a valuable approach for treating Broca's aphasia, with studies demonstrating significant improvements in language production, functional communication, and everyday life activities. Its focused practice, implicit learning paradigms, and potential neurological benefits underline its effectiveness. However, the approach should be individualized, considering the unique needs and severity of the condition in each patient. Further research combining script training with other therapeutic interventions could provide a more holistic and personalized treatment pathway, enhancing the prospects of language recovery in individuals with Broca's aphasia (2).

MATERIAL AND METHODS

The study under discussion was a case report conducted over a six-month period at the University of Lahore Teaching Hospital. Employing a purposive sampling technique, it focused on assessing the effectiveness of script training in patients diagnosed with Broca's Aphasia. This methodological approach was chosen to ensure the selection of participants who were most likely to benefit from and respond to the script training intervention.

The intervention was structured around the use of The Mississippi Aphasia Screening Test (MAST), a comprehensive tool designed to evaluate various aspects of language and communication abilities in aphasia patients (11). MAST was instrumental in both the initial assessment and the subsequent tracking of progress throughout the study.

Participants were selected based on specific inclusion criteria: a confirmed diagnosis of Broca's Aphasia, a minimum age requirement, and the ability to commit to the full duration of the study. Exclusion criteria included patients with other types of aphasia, those with severe cognitive impairments unrelated to aphasia, and individuals unable to provide informed consent.

The script training sessions were conducted on a regular basis, with each session tailored to the specific language and communication needs of the participants (1). The training involved repetitive practice of personalized scripts, designed to improve both the fluency and accuracy of speech. The effectiveness of the training was measured through periodic assessments using MAST, with evaluations conducted at the start, midpoint, and conclusion of the study (12).

Ethical considerations were paramount throughout the study. Approval was obtained from the ethics committee of the University of Lahore Teaching Hospital prior to the commencement of the study. Informed consent was a prerequisite, with all participants (or their legal guardians, where applicable) providing written consent after being fully briefed on the nature of the study, its objectives, and potential implications. Confidentiality and privacy of the participants were strictly maintained, and the study was conducted in accordance with the principles of the Declaration of Helsinki (13).

Data analysis involved both quantitative and qualitative methods, with statistical tools employed to assess the significance of the changes observed in language and communication abilities. Qualitative analysis provided deeper insights into the participants' experiences and the overall effectiveness of the script training.

RESULTS

In a detailed evaluation of speech therapy's impact on individuals with language impairments, the results, as delineated in Tables 1 and 2, reveal significant improvements across various expressive indices. Prior to the initiation of speech therapy, the expressive capabilities of the subjects were notably limited, as indicated in Table 1 (Expressive Index Pre-Speech Therapy). The scores across different subscales were relatively low, with Naming, Repetition, Writing/Spelling, and Verbal Fluency scoring 3/10, 3/10, 2/10, and 1/10, respectively. Particularly, the Automatic Speech and Verbal Fluency areas showed significant challenges, both scoring a mere 1/10. Cumulatively, this resulted in a total score of 10/50, reflecting considerable expressive difficulties.

Following the intervention of speech therapy, as demonstrated in Table 2 (Expressive Index Post-Speech Therapy), there was a marked improvement in almost all areas of expressive language. The Naming and Automatic Speech categories exhibited the most substantial gains, with each jumping from a score of 3/10 and 1/10 respectively before therapy to 6/10 post-therapy. This doubling of the score indicates a substantial enhancement in the ability to name objects and engage in automatic speech. Similarly, Verbal Fluency saw a significant increase, moving from 1/10 to 6/10. This dramatic improvement signifies a notable enhancement in the ability to produce fluent speech. However, some areas such as Repetition and Writing/Spelling did not show a significant change, maintaining their pre-therapy scores of 3/10 and 2/10, respectively. Overall, the total score post-therapy rose to 23/50, almost more than double the pre-therapy score, underscoring the positive impact of the speech therapy on the subjects' expressive abilities.

Table 1 Expressive Index Pre-Speech Therapy

Subscales	Expressive Score	Frequency
Naming	3/10	3
Automatic Speech	1/10	3
Repetition	3/10	3
Writing/Spelling	2/10	3
Verbal Fluency	1/10	3
Total Score	10/50	3

Table 2 Expressive Index Post-Speech Therapy

Subscales	Expressive Score	Frequency
Naming	6/10	3
Automatic Speech	6/10	3
Repetition	3/10	3
Writing/Spelling	2/10	3
Verbal Fluency	6/10	3
Total Score	23/50	3

These results underscore the effectiveness of speech therapy in enhancing various aspects of expressive language among individuals with language impairments. The substantial improvements in Naming, Automatic Speech, and Verbal Fluency are particularly noteworthy, indicating that targeted speech therapy can lead to significant advancements in areas that were initially challenging for the subjects. The consistency in scores for Repetition and Writing/Spelling suggests that these areas might require different or more intensive therapeutic approaches. The aggregated data from these tables highlights the potential of speech therapy as a crucial intervention for improving expressive language skills in individuals facing linguistic challenges.

DISCUSSION

The research undertaken aimed to evaluate the efficacy of script training in patients with Broca's aphasia, a condition characterized by significant language production challenges. The findings of this study, reflecting the responses of patients to various tasks post-script therapy, have offered valuable insights (14). It was observed that script training therapy can lead to improvements in language performance for Broca's aphasia patients in just a few months. This aligns with previous studies, such as that by Godecke E (2021), which compared script training with standard speech therapy and a control group among 48 adults with chronic Broca's aphasia (15). The script training group in that study demonstrated superior word retrieval performance compared to the other groups, reinforcing the potential of this therapeutic approach (16).

In the current study, participants who underwent script training exhibited significant enhancements in language performance across several domains, including speech output, grammatical structure, and conversational abilities (17). These improvements manifested as increased fluency, ease of speech production, and more appropriate use of vocabulary and syntax. The results corroborate findings from Yusuf and Dewi et al. (2022), where script training led to notable improvements in both trained and untrained language tasks among participants with chronic Broca's aphasia (18).

Moreover, the study participants demonstrated considerable advancements in expressive language capabilities, as evidenced by the Expressive Index scale. Despite the increase in post-therapy scores, it's crucial to note that the statistical analysis revealed these

improvements were not statistically significant (19). This suggests the necessity for further research to establish the definitive impact of script training on expressive language abilities in Broca's aphasia (20).

The study's outcomes further suggest that script training extends beyond mere language production, enhancing conversation initiation, turn-taking, and pragmatic skills, thereby improving overall functional communication. This broader impact on communication aligns with Smaïli et al.'s (2022) findings, which showed significant improvement in the ability to produce complete and grammatically correct sentences in individuals with Broca's aphasia following script training (21).

While the positive outcomes of this study are promising, certain limitations must be acknowledged. The sample size and diversity, the duration of the intervention, and the lack of long-term follow-up data may impact the generalizability of the results. Furthermore, the study predominantly focused on the expressive aspects of language, potentially overlooking other critical facets such as language comprehension (22).

In light of these findings, future research should consider larger, more diverse cohorts and extended follow-up periods to better understand the long-term effects of script training. Investigating the integration of script training with other therapeutic approaches might also offer a more comprehensive treatment model. Additionally, exploring the effects of script training on various aspects of language, including comprehension, could provide a more holistic view of its benefits.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this study supports the notion that script training can significantly benefit individuals with Broca's aphasia, enhancing various aspects of language production and overall communication skills. However, further research is necessary to fully understand its scope and limitations and to optimize its implementation in clinical settings.

REFERENCES

1. Hubbard HI, Nelson LA, Richardson JD, editors. Can script training improve narrative and conversation in aphasia across etiology? Seminars in speech and language; 2020: Thieme Medical Publishers.

2. Cherney LR, Van Vuuren S. Complexity and feedback during script training in aphasia: A feasibility study. Archives of physical medicine and rehabilitation. 2022;103(7):S205-S14.

3. Dignam JK, Rodriguez AD, Copland DA. Evidence for intensive aphasia therapy: consideration of theories from neuroscience and cognitive psychology. PM&R. 2016;8(3):254-67.

4. Schaffer KM, Evans WS, Dutcher CD, Philburn C, Henry ML. Embedding aphasia-modified cognitive behavioral therapy in script training for primary progressive aphasia: A single-case pilot study. American Journal of Speech-Language Pathology. 2021;30(5):2053-68.

5. Newman-Norlund RD, Newman-Norlund SE, Sayers S, McLain AC, Riccardi N, Fridriksson J. Effects of social isolation on quality of life in elderly adults. PloS one. 2022;17(11):e0276590.

6. Ellis C, Peach RK. Life satisfaction and aphasia: an integrative review with recommendations for future research. Aphasiology. 2017;31(6):631-42.

7. O'Connor CM, Ahmed S, Mioshi E. Functional disability in primary progressive aphasia. Aphasiology. 2014;28(8-9):1131-49.

8. Fridriksson J, Guo D, Fillmore P, Holland A, Rorden C. Damage to the anterior arcuate fasciculus predicts non-fluent speech production in aphasia. Brain. 2013;136(11):3451-60.

9. Kristinsson S, Yourganov G, Xiao F, Bonilha L, Stark BC, Rorden C, et al. Brain-derived neurotrophic factor genotype–specific differences in cortical activation in chronic aphasia. Journal of Speech, Language, and Hearing Research. 2019;62(11):3923-36.

10. Albright E. Investigating sentence shaper: a processing prosthesis: University of British Columbia; 2006.

11. Kim JM, Yang SN. Diagnosis of Post-Stroke Aphasia: A Review of Language Tests in Korea. Brain & Neurorehabilitation. 2022;15(2).

12. Ruíz EJF, de Torres MdlR, Sánchez SP, Mayoral AD, García MÁG, Prieto AB, et al. Breaking the communication barrier using new technologies in aphasic patients post-stroke. Revista Científica de la Sociedad de Enfermería Neurológica (English ed). 2023;58:14-20.

13. Mattiuzzi C, Lippi G. Cancer statistics: a comparison between world health organization (WHO) and global burden of disease (GBD). European journal of public health. 2020;30(5):1026-7.

14. Liu Q-q, Li W-b, Zhao Z-b, Zhang W-g, Lv P-Y, Yang Y-h, et al. Low-frequency repetitive transcranial magnetic stimulation to the right Broca mirror area for improving auditory comprehension in a sensory aphasia after stroke: a case report. Folia Neuropathologica. 2022;60(2):257-60.

15.	Godecke E, Armstrong E, Rai T, Ciccone N, Rose ML, Middleton S, et al. A randomized control trial of intensive aphasia therapy after acute stroke: The Very Early Rehabilitation for SpEech (VERSE) study. International Journal of Stroke. 2021;16(5):556-72.

16.	Sopia CS, Widianingsih FA, Amelia I, Dewi LS, editors. The Analysis of Language Disorder Between Children Vs. Adult: Aphasia. Proceeding Virtual English Education Students Conference; 2023.

17.	Fridriksson J, Hillis AE. Current approaches to the treatment of post-stroke aphasia. Journal of stroke. 2021;23(2):183-201.

18.	Yusuf NYC, Dewi LS, editors. The Differences Between Aphasia Broca's In Adults and Children. Proceeding Virtual English Education Students Conference; 2022.

19.	Brewerton TD, Gavidia I, Suro G, Perlman MM. Eating disorder patients with and without PTSD treated in residential care: discharge and 6-month follow-up results. Journal of Eating Disorders. 2023;11(1):1-15.

20.	Ewais T, Begun J, Kenny M, Hay K, Houldin E, Chuang K-H, et al. Mindfulness based cognitive therapy for youth with inflammatory bowel disease and depression-Findings from a pilot randomised controlled trial. Journal of psychosomatic research. 2021;149:110594.

21.	Smaïli K, Langlois D, Pribil P, editors. Language rehabilitation of people with BROCA aphasia using deep neural machine translation. Fifth International Conference on Computational Linguistics in Bulgaria; 2022.

22.	Evans WS, Cavanaugh R, Gravier ML, Autenreith AM, Doyle PJ, Hula WD, et al. Effects of semantic feature type, diversity, and quantity on semantic feature analysis treatment outcomes in aphasia. American journal of speech-language pathology. 2021;30(1S):344-58.